Review of the Current State of Development of the Progress Indicators in National Long-Term Renovation Strategies

C. Beltrán Velamazán, M. Monzón Chavarrías, B. López Mesa

Afiliación: Grupo de Investigación en Arquitectura (GIA) Instituto de Investigación en Ingeniería de Aragón (I3A) Universidad de Zaragoza, Mariano Esquillor s/n, 50018, Zaragoza, Spain. Tel. +34-656968201, e-mail: cbeltran@unizar.es

Summary

The Commission Recommendation (EU) 2019/786 created a clear path towards a low and zero-emission building stock by 2050, based on milestones and progress indicators. National Long-Term Renovation Strategies (LTRS) are required to ensure the renovation into energy efficient and decarbonised buildings. This paper reviews the current status of the development of the progress indicators carried out by the Member States.

Introduction

European directives and strategies, such as Directive (EU) 2018/844 [1], the European Green Deal and the Renovation Wave, point out the importance of decarbonising the building sector in achieving the climate targets set by the European Union (EU) for 2030, 2040 and 2050. In this sense, the decarbonisation of existing buildings is a priority. To do so, it is necessary to increase the current annual energy renovation rate from 0.4 - 1.2% to a renewal rate of 3% according to the European Commission. One of the most important barriers to increasing the rate of energy refurbishment is the lack of open data on the progress that is being carried in the different member countries. For this reason, Directive (EU) 2018/844 recommends that EU countries use measurable progress indicators to monitor the actual gradual decarbonisation of national building stocks.

In this way, this paper's aim is to review the current state of the development of this progress indicators.

Methodology

The paper is proposed as a review of the current state of the progress indicators in the countries, comparing the development presented in their LTRS, with the progress indicators proposed in the Commission Recommendation (EU) 2019/786 [2].

Results

A comparative table has been made with the current status of the European and national progress indicators of each country, observing a significant lack in their implementation due to the absence of data. This lack of data is an aspect indicated by several countries.

Conclusions

Obtaining reliable indicators of progress is a key point to be tackled in the future strategies of the member countries.

The most frequently provided indicators are the reductions of emissions and the actual energy savings achieved, with a general lack of cost-effectiveness of main renovation measure.

Within the indicators sets provided by the countries, the most represented blocks are: 32% correspond to the overview of the national building stock, 24% to the estimate of expected energy savings and wider benefits, 12% to the promotion of smart technologies, 10% to energy poverty.

The Government of Spain has contributed only with 17 in the ERESEE 2020 [3] out of the 70 indicators proposed in the European Recommendation, most of which remain without contributing due to their difficulty in obtaining it. Twelve of them, the 70%, correspond to the general vision indicators of the real estate stock.

Only three strategies meet half of the proposed indicators out of the 30 countries with strategies, 9 have no indicators, and 19 have fewer than 5 and 24 of the strategies have fewer than 10 indicators.

REFERENCES

[1]. DIRECTIVE (EU) 2018/844 OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL of 30 May 2018 [...] energy performance of buildings [...]. Official Journal of the European Union.

- [2]. THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION. COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (EU) 2019/786 of 8 May 2019 on building renovation. Official Journal of the European Union
- [3]. MITMA. 2020 UPDATE OF THE LONG-TERM STRATEGY FOR ENERGY RENOVATION IN THE BUILDING SECTOR IN SPAIN (ERESEE). June 202

Table 1. Relationship between the progress indicators of the Commission Recommendation 2019/786 and the LTRS of each country.

initiatives to promote and actions to target and actions as well to target to target and communities, as well to target to target and communities, as well to target to target and to target to	of buildings per building type of buildings per building age of buildings per building age of buildings per building size of buildings per building size of duildings per building size of dwellings per building type of dwellings per building size of dwellings per building size of dwellings per building size of m2 per building type of m2 per building type of m2 per building size of per building sector of NZEBs per building sector	X X X X X	X	X	X	Cyprus	X	X X X	X	X X X	X X X X X X X	Ireland	Latvia	X X	Luxembourg	Matta	X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X	X	Slovakia	X	X
initiatives to promote and actions to target and actions as well to target to target and communities, as well to target to target and communities, as well to target to target and to target to	of buildings per building age of buildings per building size of buildings per building size of buildings per building size of dwellings per building gype of dwellings per building age of dwellings per building age of dwellings per building size of dwellings per building size of m2 per building type of m2 per building size of m2 per building per per nual energy consumption per building tinual energy consumption per buildings per ren nual % of renovated buildings per ren nual % of renovated buildings per ren nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building size movated m2 per building sector sof NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u bilc incentives for deep renovation bilc and private investments in deep re	X X X X X	X		X		X	X		X	X X X X X				X		X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X X			X	X X X X X X X
initiatives to promote small actions to target and actions to target and actions to target and actions to target and actions and actions and actions segments of the nat confered buildings and actions segments of the nat cost-effect costs and communities, as well to target lona building stock. The deep effective actions and communities, as well to target lona building stock. The deep effective communities, as well to target lona building stock. The deep effective communities, as well to target lona building stock. The deep effective communities are well to target lona building stock. The deep effective communities are well to target lona building stock. The deep effective communities are well to target long to communities. The deep effective communities are well to target long to communities. The deep effective communities are well to target long to communities. The deep effective communities are well to target long to communities. The deep effective communities are well to target long to communities and communities are well to target long to communities. The deep effective communities are well to target long the deep effective communities are well to target long the deep effective communities. The well-to-communities are well to target long the deep effective communities are well to target long the deep effective communities. The well-to-communities are well-to-communities and communities are well to target long the well-to-communities. The well-to-communities are well-to-communities and communities are well-to-communities. The well-to-communities are well-to-communities and communities are well-to-communities.	of buildings per building size of buildings per building sper of dwellings per building type of dwellings per building age of dwellings per building age of dwellings per building size of m2 per buildings per rend onual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building size movated m2 per building size movated m2 per building size movated m2 per building sper mber of EPCs per building sper of EPCs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X X X X	X		X		X	X		X	X X X				X		X X X X X X X X X X X X X X			X	X X X X X X
initiatives to promote and actions to target and actions identifica smart echnologies and and the worst-performing to simulate iton of well-connected buildings and and the worst-performing to simulate iton of well-connected buildings actions: segments of the nat cost-effect cost- and communities, as well to target in a building stock, the deep and communities, as well to target in a building stock, the deep and communities, as well to target in a building stock, the deep and communities, as well to target in a building stock, the deep and communities, as well to target in a building stock, the deep and communities, as well to target in a building stock, the deep and communities, as well to target in a building stock, the deep and communities and communities and communities are well to target in a building stock.	of buildings per climatic zone of dwellings per building type of dwellings per building age of dwellings per building age of dwellings per building age of dwellings per climatic zone of m2 per building size of m2 per building age of m2 per building size of m2 per building size of m2 per climatic zone nual energy consumption per building to nual energy consumption per end use nual energy consumption per end use nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building sper mber of EPCs per building age mber of EPCs per building sector scheffectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per buildings tal and annual proportion of buildings tal and annual proportion of buildings tal builc incentives for deep renovation builc incentives for deep renovation builc investments in deep re	X X X X X	X		X		X	X			X X X				X		X X X X X X X X X X X X				X X X X X
initiatives to promote and actions to target and actions identifica smart echnologies and and the worst-performing to simulate from of well-connected buildings and the worst-performing to simulate from of well-connected buildings and communities, as well to target from building stock, three deep and communities, as well to target from building stock, three deep frequency as well to target from building stock, three deep frequency as well to target from building stock, three deep frequency as well to target from buildings stock, three deep frequency as well to target from buildings stock, three deep frequency as well to target from buildings stock, three deep frequency as well to target from the stock frequency and th	of dwellings per building type of dwellings per building age of dwellings per building age of dwellings per building size of dwellings per climatic zone of m2 per building type of m2 per building type of m2 per building type of m2 per building size onual energy consumption per building terminal energy consumption per end use nual % of renovated buildings per renoual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building type movated m2 per building size novated m2 per building age mber of EPCs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per buildings at blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing th	X X X X X	X		X		X	X			X X X				X		X X X X X X X X X X X				X X X X
initiatives to promote and actions to target and actions identifical smart technologies and and entropy to separate the properties and communities, as well to target form building stock, tive deep effective and communities, as well to target form building stock, tive deep effective as kellia and entropy and and actions segments of the national and actions and communities, as well to target form building stock, tive deep effective as kellia and actions are actions are actions and actions are actions	of dwellings per building age of dwellings per building size of dwellings per climatic zone of m2 per building lype of m2 per building lype of m2 per building age of m2 per building size of m2 per building size of m2 per building size of m2 per climatic zone nual energy consumption per building linual energy consumption per buildings per renoual % of renovated buildings per renoual % of renovated buildings per building vize novated m2 per building lype novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building size movated m2 per building size movated m2 per building sper mber of EPCs per building sper mber of EPCs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives from deep renovations blic and private investments in deep re	X X X X X	X		X		X	X			X X X				X		X X X X X X X X X X				X X X X
initiatives to promote and actions to target and actions identifical smart technologies and and entropy to separate the properties and communities, as well to target form building stock, tive deep effective and communities, as well to target form building stock, tive deep effective as kellia and entropy and and actions segments of the national and actions and communities, as well to target form building stock, tive deep effective as kellia and actions are actions are actions and actions are actions	of dwellings per building size of dwellings per climatic zone of m2 per building type of m2 per building type of m2 per building size of m2 per building size of m2 per building size of m2 per climatic zone nual energy consumption per building to nual energy consumption per end use nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building size mber of EPCs per building type mber of EPCs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector steffectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic incentives for deep renovation blic investments in policy addressing the	X X X X X	X		X		X	X			X X X				X		X X X X X X X X X				X X X X
initiatives to promote and actions to farget and actions identifical smart technologies and well-common segments of the national cost-effect cost-and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep effective and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep effective as kelling as well to target ional building stock, tive deep effective as kelling and action and action and action of the property of the prop	of dwellings per climatic zone of m2 per building type of m2 per building age of m2 per building age of m2 per building size of m2 per building size of m2 per climatic zone nual energy consumption per building t nual energy consumption per end use nual % of renovated buildings per rend nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building type novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building age mber of EPCs per building age mber of EPCs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing th	X X X X X	X		X		X	X			X X X				X		X X X X X X X X			X	X
initiatives to promote and actions to farget and actions identifical smart technologies and an advanced by the well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat consentrate and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	of m2 per building type of m2 per building age of m2 per building age of m2 per building size of m2 per building size of m2 per building size of m2 per climatic zone nual energy consumption per building t nual energy consumption per end use nual % of renovated buildings per ren nual % of renovated buildings per ren nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building type novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building age mber of EPCs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector of N	X X X X X	X		X		X	X			X X X				X		X X X X X X			X	X
initiatives to promote and actions to farget and actions identifical smart technologies and an advanced by the well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat consentrate and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	of m2 per building age of m2 per building size of m2 per building size of m2 per building size of m2 per dimatic zone nual energy consumption per building nual energy consumption per end use nual % of renovated buildings per renc nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building type novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building size movated m2 per building ge mber of EPCs per building type mber of EPCs per building type mber of RZEBs per building sector stof NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X X X X	X		X		X	X			X X X				X		X X X X X			X	X
initiatives to promote and actions to farget and actions identifical smart technologies and an advanced by the well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat consentrate and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	of m2 per building size of m2 per climatic zone nual energy consumption per building to nual energy consumption per end use nual % of renovated buildings per reno nual % of renovated buildings per reno nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building type mber of EPCs per energy class mber of RZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X X X X	X		X		X	X			X X X				X		X X X X			X	Х
initiatives to promote and actions to farget and actions identifical smart technologies and an advanced by the well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat consentrate and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	of m2 per climatic zone nual energy consumption per building t nual energy consumption per end use nual wergy consumption per end use nual % of renovated buildings per renc nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building type novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building age mber of EPCs per building age mber of EPCs per building sector t of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector t of NZEBs per building sector t of NZEBs per building sector at energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X X X X	X		X		X	X			X X X				X		X X X			Х	
initiatives to promote and actions to farget and actions identifical smart technologies and an advanced by the well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat consentrate and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	nual energy consumption per end use nual % of renovated buildings per rent nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building type novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building age mber of EPCs per building sype mber of EPCs per building sector of NZEBs per	X X X X X	X		X		X	X			X X X				Х		X X X			Х	
Initiatives to promote and actions to larget and actions identification in the worst-performing to stimulate thou of well-continuous and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, and activities and activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	nual % of renovated buildings per reno nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building type novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building age mber of EPCs per energy class mber of RPCs per energy class of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X X X X	X		X		X	Х			X				Х		X	X		X	X
Initiatives to promote and actions to larget and actions identification in the worst-performing to stimulate thou of well-continuous and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, and activities and activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	nual % of renovated buildings per build novated m2 per building type novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building age mber of EPCs per building ge mber of EPCs per energy class mber of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector building sector building sector building sector building sector building sector building sector per per per per per per per per per per per per per per per	X X X X X	X		X		X	Х			Х				Х		Х	Х		Х	
Initiatives to promote and actions to larget and actions identification in the worst-performing to stimulate thou of well-continuous and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, and activities and activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	novated m2 per building type novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building size mber of EPCs per building ge mber of EPCs per building type mber of EPCs per energy class mber of NZEBs per building sector of MZEBs per building sector of MZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X	X X X X X X		X		X	Х							Х		$\overline{}$	Х			
Initiatives to promote and actions to larget and actions identification in the worst-performing to stimulate thou of well-continuous and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, and activities and activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	novated m2 per building size novated m2 per building age mber of EPCs per building type mber of EPCs per energy class mber of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me stal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X	x x x x x		X			Х			Х			Y I							
Initiatives to promote and actions to larget and actions identification in the worst-performing to stimulate thou of well-continuous and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, and activities and activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	novated m2 per building age mber of EPCs per building type mber of EPCs per energy class mber of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me stal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X	X X X X X	X	X			Х						^			Х				
Initiatives to promote and actions to larget and actions identification in the worst-performing to stimulate thou of well-continuous and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, and activities and activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	mber of EPCs per building type mber of EPCs per energy class mber of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings ublic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X	X X X X X X	X	X			Х									Х				
initiatives to promote and actions to farget and actions identifical smart technologies and an advanced by the well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat consentrate and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	mber of EPCs per energy class mber of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X	X X X X X	X	X			Х		V .							Х				
initiatives to promote and actions to farget and actions identifical smart technologies and an advanced by the well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat consentrate and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	mber of EPCs per energy class mber of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X	X X X X	X	X					Х	Х						Х				Х
Initiatives to promote and actions to larget and actions identification in the worst-performing to stimulate thou of well-continuous and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, and activities and activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	mber of NZEBs per building sector cof NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X	X X X	X	X			X	Х		Х						Х				
Initiatives to promote and actions to larget and actions identification in the worst-performing to stimulate thou of well-continuous and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock, and activities and activities and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	of NZEBs per building sector st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X	X X X	X	X			^			Х					Х	Х	Х		Х	
initiatives to promote and actions to farget and actions identifical smart technologies and an advanced by the well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat consentrate and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep settles and communities, as well to target ional building stock.	st-effectiveness of main renovation me st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X	X X X	X							Х						Х	Х			
initiatives to promote policies and actions to target and actions smart actehologies and and the worst-performing to stimulate well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat construction and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep as setting and actions as well to target ional building stock, tive deep as setting and address as well and the setting and actions to the setting action to the setting act	st-effectiveness of main renovation me tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing the	X X	X X X	X	X						Х						Х				
initiatives to promote policies and actions to target and actions smart actehologies and and the worst-performing to stimulate well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat construction and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep as setting and actions as well to target ional building stock, tive deep as setting and address as well and the setting and actions to the setting action to the setting act	tal energy saving potential per building tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing th	X	X X X	X	Х	1					X						X				
initiatives to promote policies and actions to target and actions smart actehologies and and the worst-performing to stimulate well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat construction and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep as setting and actions as well to target ional building stock, tive deep as setting and address as well and the setting and actions to the setting action to the setting act	tal and annual proportion of buildings u blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing th	X	X X X	^							x						X	Х			
initiatives to promote and actions to target and actions to target and actions to target and actions are technically and the worst-performing to stimulate well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat cost-effect and communities, as well to target ional building stock, tive deep as settling and continuous as well as a settling and continuous as well to target ional building stock, tive deep as settling and continuous and continuou	blic incentives for deep renovation blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing th	X	X				Х	X			X					Х	X	^			
initiatives to promote policies and actions to target small actions to target well-connected buildings and and communities, as well to target inoral building stock. See Refile and Advanced buildings actions segments of the nat and communities, as well to target inoral building stock. See Refile and Advanced buildings actions as well to target inoral building stock. See Refile and Advanced buildings actions are settled by a communities, as well to target inoral building stock. See Refile and Advanced buildings actions are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a community of the properties are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a community of the properties are settled by a community of the properties are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a community of the properties are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities and communities. The properties are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities and communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities.	blic and private investments in deep re ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing th	X	X								X				\rightarrow	^	X				
initiatives to promote policies and actions to target small actions to target well-connected buildings and and communities, as well to target inoral building stock. See Refile and Advanced buildings actions segments of the nat and communities, as well to target inoral building stock. See Refile and Advanced buildings actions as well to target inoral building stock. See Refile and Advanced buildings actions are settled by a communities, as well to target inoral building stock. See Refile and Advanced buildings actions are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a community of the properties are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a community of the properties are settled by a community of the properties are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a community of the properties are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities and communities. The properties are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities and communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities. The properties are settled by a communities are settled by a communities and communities are settled by a communities.	ergy savings from deep renovations blic investments in policy addressing th	X	Х		_						^			_	\rightarrow		×				
militatives to promote policies and actions to target small technologies and and the worst-performing well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat and communities, as well to target ional building stock. Secure 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1.	blic investments in policy addressing th		_	_	-									-	\rightarrow						
initiatives to promote policies and actions to target smart technologies and amand the worst-performing well-connected buildings actions segments of the nat and communities, as well to target ional building stock. Settlis, and addication is a settlis, and addication of the national segments of																	Х				
mintanves to promote smart technologies and and smart technologies and and communities, as well to target and communities and communit	of rented houses with EPCs below a ce		Х	_										_			Х	Х			Х
mittatives to promote smart technologies and and well-connected buildings actions and communities, as well to target as well as well as well to target as well as well-connected buildings and connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-conn		4									Х						Х				
mittatives to promote smart technologies and and well-connected buildings actions and communities, as well to target as well as well as well to target as well as well-connected buildings and connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-conn	ergy poverty indicators: % of people aft	1	X								Х			Х			Х				
mittatives to promote smart technologies and and well-connected buildings actions and communities, as well to target as well as well as well to target as well as well-connected buildings and connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-conn	ergy poverty indicators: proportion of c		Х								Х			Х			Х	Х			
mittatives to promote smart technologies and and well-connected buildings actions and communities, as well to target as well as well as well to target as well as well-connected buildings and connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-conn	ergy poverty indicators: arrears on utilit	t X	Х								Х			Х			Х				
initiatives to promote smart technologies and and well-connected buildings and communities, as well to target as well as well to target as well as well as well-connected buildings and to a connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-con	ergy poverty indicators: population livin	X	Х								Х			Х			Х				
mittatives to promote smart technologies and and well-connected buildings actions and communities, as well to target as well as well as well to target as well as well-connected buildings and connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected by the well-connected buildings and the well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-connected buildings are well-connected buildings and well-conn	of buildings in lowest energy classes	Х	Х											Х			Х				
initiatives to promote month technologies and and well-connected buildings actions and communities, as well to targing the state of the	of renovated public buildings per build	X	Х								Х						Х				Х
initiatives to promote smart technologies and well-connected buildings and communities, as well communities, as well of the communities of the communi	of renovated public buildings per build	_	X								Х						Х				Х
inflatives to promote smart technologies and well-connected buildings and communities, as well communities, as well of the communities of the communit	of renovated public buildings per clima	1															Х				
mitiatives to promote smart technologies and well-connected buildings and and communities, as we compared to the communities of	of buildings equipped with building ene		Х			Х		Х			Х	Х					Х	Х			
smart technologie well-connected by and communities, as exilts and adult of the connected by a communities, as exilts and adult of the connected by a connec	blic and private investments in smart to		X			 ^					X				\rightarrow		X				
smart technologie well-connected by and communities, as exilts and adult of the connected by a communities, as exilts and adult of the connected by a connec	izens participating in energy	1	×	-	-						x			-	\rightarrow		X	Х			
			_	-							X		-	-	\rightarrow			_			
	of graduated students university cours		X	-							_				-		X	X			
	of graduated students professional/tec	_	X								Х			_	_		Х	Х			
	of installers skilled in new technologies	8	X								X						X	X			.,
	dget of national research programmes		X								X						Х	Х			Х
	rticipation of national universities in in t	t	Х								Х						Х	Х			
Redu	duction in energy costs per household	X	X												X	Х	Х	Х		Х	Х
	crease in energy poverty		X														Х	Х			
Actua	tual energy savings achieved	X	X		X		Х				Х		Х	Х	X		Х	Х	Х	Х	
Avera Avera Them	erage/aggregate indoor air quality in die	×	Х				Х				Х										
Therr	ermal comfort index (TCI)		Х				Х										Х				
© 5 Cost	st of avoided illnesses		Х														Х				
~ × · · · ·	duction in health costs attributable to e	:	Х											Х			Х				
Redu	duction of whole life carbon		Х														Х				
Disat	sability Adjusted Life Year (DALY)/Qual		X																		
Da Labor	oour productivity gains from better work		X														Х				
Redu	duction of emissions	X	X	X				Х			Х		Х	X	X	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	
d w d	addition of official of the building sector (N° of j	_	X	Ť	X												Х	Х			
h, s	PP increase in the building sector	X	×		<u> </u>									X			X	X			
ngs salth		_	X														,				
avir one	energy imports for the Member State (e										X			-				Х			
	manual/manuamtion of	1	X								$\overline{}$										
tne aggrega N° of	moval/prevention of accessibility barrie		X								Х						\ .	Х			
	of integrated/aggregated projects		Х														Х				
use of bubliq——	of integrated/aggregated projects rceived risk of energy efficiency		X								Х						Х				
Public	of integrated/aggregated projects received risk of energy efficiency blic investments as percentage of total		X								Х						Х	Х			
guiding inve	of integrated/aggregated projects received risk of energy efficiency blic investments as percentage of total blic-private partnership initiatives		_														Х				
accessible One-	of integrated/aggregated projects received risk of energy efficiency blic investments as percentage of total		Х	_										_							
nsparent Aware	of integrated/aggregated projects received risk of energy efficiency blic investments as percentage of total blic-private partnership initiatives		X		1	1											х	Х			

Revista "Jornada de Jóvenes Investigadores del I3A", vol. 9 (Actas de la X Jornada de Jóvenes Investigadores del I3A – 21 de octubre de 2021). ISSN 2341-4790.