

# A MATTER OF TIMING: THE RELEVANCE OF THE LAPSE OF TIME BETWEEN DEATH AND THE CELEBRATION OF THE FINAL JUDGMENT IN THE MIDDLE AGES

*Un problema de cronometría:  
Relevancia del lapso entre la muerte y la celebración  
del Juicio Final en la Edad Media*

Daniel AÑUA-TEJEDOR<sup>1</sup>  
Universidad del País Vasco/EHU

## **Abstract**

Between the 12<sup>th</sup> and 15<sup>th</sup> centuries there was a theological evolution of great transcendence that shook the spiritual life of the believers. The fragmentary subdivision of the geography of the beyond conditioned directly the liturgy and the rites of the faithful in their attempt to achieve salvation after death. One of the changes affected the moment in which the judgment—which would lead to the condemnation or salvation of the Christian—would take place, specifically the proximity or distance in the time of the celebration of the same. Throughout these centuries, medieval Hispanic literature has been reflecting not only this evolution but also the search for greater effectiveness in controlling the lives of believers by ecclesiastical elites.

*Key words:* medieval literature Final Judgment, individual judgment, Purgatory, *pre mortem*, *post mortem*, 12<sup>th</sup>-15<sup>th</sup> centuries

## **Resumen**

Entre los siglos XII y XV se produjo una evolución teológica de gran transcendencia que conmovió la vida espiritual de los creyentes. La subdivisión parcelaria de la

---

1 Licenciado en Filología Inglesa y en Filología Hispánica y doctor en Literatura Comparada y Estudios Literarios por la Universidad del País Vasco. Correo electrónico: danua001@hotmail.com. Fecha de recepción: 12 de septiembre de 2017. Fecha de aceptación: 27 de noviembre de 2017.

geografía del más allá condicionó directamente la liturgia y los ritos de los fieles en su intento por lograr la salvación después de la muerte. Una de las modificaciones afectó al instante en el que el juicio —que conduciría a la condenación o salvación del cristiano— tendría lugar, concretamente a la proximidad o lejanía en el tiempo de la celebración del mismo. A lo largo de estos siglos, la literatura hispánica medieval ha ido reflejando no sólo esta evolución sino también la búsqueda de una mayor eficacia en el control de la vida de los creyentes por parte de las elites eclesíásticas.

*Palabras clave:* literatura medieval, Juicio Final, juicio individual, purgatorio, *pre mortem*, *post mortem*, siglos XII-XV

## 1. CHANGES IN ICONOGRAPHY, MIRROR OF THEOLOGY

Medieval literature, iconography and theology show a geographical restructuring of the beyond and a progressive modification and reorientation of the celebration of the Final Judgment. These reforms, between the thirteenth and fifteenth centuries, improved the efficiency and interference of the Church on the behavior of believers.

The evolution of iconographic representations of the Final Judgment throughout the Middle Ages runs parallel to the expectations of believers in the latter part of their life. According to Philippe Ariès, the first millennium Christians believed that after death began a period of rest in peace culminating with the resurrection and the second coming of Christ at the end of time. There was no fear of the Final Judgment knowing that they were safe due to having been baptized. Thus, representations of Christ coming back to the end of time were those of a glorious Christ *tal como subió a los cielos el día de la Ascensión, o tal como lo describe el visionario del Apocalipsis*.<sup>2</sup> This Christ appears surrounded by four winged beings, the four evangelists, and the twenty-four elders of the Apocalypse of John.

It is important to remember that all baptized believers or churchgoers who, after their death and burial *ad sanctos*, slept *en la paz de la Iglesia, confiados a la tierra de Iglesia* without harboring any fear of *severidades del Juicio* are considered saints at that time. Ariès points out that we can find authors like Honorius Autum (1080 – c. 1153) for whom the cemetery *ad*

2 Philippe Ariès, *El hombre ante la muerte*, Madrid, Taurus, 2011: 113.

*sanctos* was the lap of the Church who, like Abraham in his bosom, cared for and protected the bodies that had been entrusted to it.

The iconography reflects how the infernal threat is gaining prominence over the centuries. Though Hell was already represented in the ninth century, it is from the eleventh to thirteenth centuries when its true iconographic development takes place framed in the Final Judgment representations of the tympana, especially following the decisive development that will take place in the Gothic.<sup>3</sup>

While the Romanesque tended to *evitar enfrentarse directamente a la imagen del Juicio Final*,<sup>4</sup> predominating in the tympana the *théophanies eschatologiques* that show Christ in his timeless glory and the *théophanies parousiaques* that resort to the time of the second coming of Christ,<sup>5</sup> from the twelfth century to the fifteenth century, representations of the Final Judgment betray *las inquietudes nuevas del hombre*.<sup>6</sup> One of the main innovations, although they had already begun in the eleventh century, is the transposition of the theme of the Final Judgment from inside churches to outside them, gaining visibility and unprecedented publicity by developing the theme in the stratified porticoes.<sup>7</sup>

The Final Judgments of the twelfth century overlap that ancient scene of the glorious Christ of the Apocalypse of St. John with a new one inspired by the Gospel of Matthew, XXV<sup>8</sup> including the resurrection of the body and the acts of judgment such as the separation of the righteous, who go to Heaven, from the damned, who are precipitated into eternal fire. Thus the second coming of Christ merges, *théophanies parousiaques*, with the Final Judgment,<sup>9</sup> which Yves Christe called: *théophanies dénaturées*.<sup>10</sup> As examples of such hybrid iconography, we can mention the portico of Beaulieu (from the early twelfth century) and the portico

---

3 Jérôme Baschet, *La civilización feudal. Europa del año mil a la colonización de América*, México, Fondo de Cultura Económica, 2009: 428.

4 Paulino Rodríguez Barral, *La Justicia del más allá. Iconografía en la corona de Aragón en la baja Edad Media*, Valencia, Universitat de València, 2007: 35.

5 Jérôme Baschet, *Les justices de l'au-delà: les représentations de l'enfer en France et en Italie (XII<sup>e</sup>-XV<sup>e</sup> siècles)*, Rome, École Française de Rome, 1993: 138.

6 Ariès, 2011: 115.

7 Marcello Anghenben, *Le Jugement dernier entre Orient et Occident*, Pace, Valentino (dir.), Paris, Editions du Cerf, 2007: 53.

8 Ariès, 2011: 116.

9 Ariès, 2011: 117.

10 Ariès, 2011: 105.

of Sainte-Foy of Conques (between 1130 and 1150) in southwestern France; and the portico of the Gloria of the Cathedral of Santiago and the church of Santa María la Real in Sangüesa in the second half of the twelfth century.

According to Georges Minois while speaking of this evolution, the giant Christ of the Apocalypse continues to dominate in the example of Beaulieu, although in coexistence with a discreet resurrection of the dead and an implied judgment. However, in the example of Sainte-Foy in Conques, Christ is judge—as indicated in the registration of his nimbus—and the separation of the righteous and the damned appears with equal space for each of them, showing how the latter are brought into the jaws of Hell.<sup>11</sup>

A Hell that also engulfs churchmen from now on and that puts an end to the ancient equivalence of saints as believers. Therefore, nobody can guarantee their salvation, *ni siquiera aquellos que han preferido la soledad de los claustros al mundo profano*.<sup>12</sup>

In the case of the Final Judgment of Compostela, we also find an imposing figure of Christ the Judge surrounded not only by the elders of the Apocalypse, but also by the evangelists, both in their human form and the form of the Tetramorph beings. Despite being a representation of Christ the judge, the acts of judgment take second place.

Moreover, in the case of Sangüesa, Christ appears twice, once enthroned as judge with the acts of the judgment compressed in the lateral spaces, and another surrounded by tetramorfos in an abrupt and hybrid combination.<sup>13</sup>

With the arrival of the thirteenth century, the second iconography prevails to the detriment of the former. As Ariès points out,<sup>14</sup> Christ no longer appears in his glory, but on a judge's throne; no longer are the evangelists (*tetramorfos*) around him, but his court: *los doce apóstoles raramente representados pegados a su lado [...], alineados más a menudo en el ensanchamiento del pórtico, a izquierda y derecha*. In this new iconography, two new actions also appear. On the one hand, the weighing

11 Georges Minois, *Historia de los Infiernos*, Barcelona, Paidós, 1994: 225.

12 Ariès, 2011: 115-116.

13 Angheben, 2007: 79.

14 Ariès, 2011: 117.

of souls (*psicostasis*) which moves to the center of the composition raising concern and anxiety:

Los elegidos y los condenados son apuntados por la balanza de san Miguel; pero, como si esta operación no fuera suficiente, son separados una segunda vez por la espada del arcángel Gabriel.

We therefore attended the judgment of each man *según el balance de su vida; las buenas y malas acciones son separadas escrupulosamente en los dos platillos de la balanza*.<sup>15</sup> As Minois states, *the trial is individualized and loses its collective aspect*.<sup>16</sup>

On the other hand, the second new action represented is the intercession of the Virgin and St. John (*deesis*) which could point the God/judge decision towards forgiveness. These intercessions *juegan un papel que no había previsto el texto de san Mateo, el papel conjugado del abogado (patronus) y del suplicante (advocare deum) que apelan a la piedad, es decir, a la gracia del soberano juez*<sup>17</sup> represented showing his wounds.<sup>18</sup>

This iconography can be seen in the cathedral of Chartres, Notre Dame in Paris, on the portico of the Coronería of the Cathedral of Burgos, dated between 1240 and 1250, and on the Last Judgement of the Cathedral of León, dated around 1270.<sup>19</sup>

As a remarkable element amongst the iconographic representations, we can also find the *liber vitae* where the balance sheet is written and the accounts of good and bad deeds are recorded. The transformation experienced by the *liber vitae* is important. Since, originally conceived as a formidable census of the universe, a cosmic book, it becomes gradually transformed into a book of individual accounts.<sup>20</sup>

Las acciones de cada hombre ya no se pierden en el espacio ilimitado de la trascendencia, ni tampoco [...] en el destino colectivo de la especie. Desde este momento ya están individualizados. El libro es, pues, a la vez, la historia de un hombre, su biografía, y un libro de cuentas (o de razón), a dos

---

15 Philippe Ariès, *Historia de la muerte en Occidente: desde la Edad Media hasta nuestros días*, Barcelona, El Acanalado, 2000: 46.

16 Minois, 1994: 226.

17 Ariès, 2011: 117.

18 Víctor García de la Concha, «La mariología en Gonzalo de Berceo», en Berceo, Gonzalo de, *Obra completa*, Isabel Uría Maqua coord., Madrid, Espasa-Calpe, 1992: 70.

19 Angheben, 2007: 112-113 and 122-123.

20 Ariès, 2000: 46.

columnas, a un lado el mal y a otro lado el bien. El nuevo espíritu contable de los hombres de negocios que comienzan entonces a descubrir su mundo propio —que se ha convertido en el nuestro— se aplica tanto al contenido de una vida como a la mercancía o a la moneda.<sup>21</sup>

The actual bookholders found in the representations, are modified as well; from the angel seen on the portico of Sainte-Foy Conques to the devils in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, who considered that the accounts would benefit them.<sup>22</sup>

These changes are closely linked to the birth of Purgatory that took place in the thirteenth century, since the existence of Purgatory implies a double judgment: *le premier au moment de la mort, le second à la fin des temps*.<sup>23</sup> Thus the tranquility of expecting the Final Judgment while we sleep —after the second coming of Christ at the end of time— is lost, in favor of a previous judgment immediately after death that will mark the beginning of a period of temporary purgation in the hereafter. Once the end of time arrives with the second coming of Christ before the Last Judgement, Purgatory will cease to exist as the temporary place that it is and the universe will freeze in its eternal duality.<sup>24</sup>

The first carved representation of the Purgatory is to be found in the western facade of the church of Santa María la Mayor in Toro built around 1300. In it, the elect are prepared to cross a first doorway and, at the same time, to leave a place where infernal flames were emerging. As Marcello Angheben indicates, some authors see in this portico a representation of Purgatory, since it would be the only place full of hellish flames that one is permitted to leave.<sup>25</sup> The representations of Purgatory become widespread in the fourteenth century as we can attest, for example, in the frescoes in the chapel of St. Martin in the old cathedral of Salamanca 1342.<sup>26</sup>

At the same time, Hell will suffer an evolution in their representations and will appear compartmentalized by rocky elements. This internal structure is linked to a complete true penal system of the hereafter where the different compartments will be dedicated to the different punishments

---

21 Ariès, 2011: 120.

22 Ariès, 2011: 121.

23 Jacques Le Goff, *La naissance du Purgatoire*, Paris, Gallimard, 1981: 15.

24 Baschet, 2009: 437-438.

25 Angheben, 2007: 125.

26 Rodríguez Barral, 2007: 165.

generally assigned to the seven deadly sins. Therefore, Hell will change from *el lugar de un desorden generalizado y de una agitación indiferenciada de los cuerpos* that characterized the general geography of the afterlife in the twelfth century, to a Hell forming part of an accurate geography based on moral topology in the fourteenth century.<sup>27</sup>

Moving forward in time, a new iconography appears on the scene that can be found in the *Artes moriendi* of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, and which leads to a further step in the process of change in mentality. According to Ariès,<sup>28</sup> the eschatological time that existed between the death of each individual and the trial that was to take place at the end of time disappears. Now, individual judgment no longer stands after death, but in the very room of the dying person, around his bed, anticipating his death. Therefore, the judgment does not happen immediately, as in the thirteenth century, but previously. The dying person is no longer declaring his last wishes surrounded by his friends and relatives, now: *La habitación ha sido invadida por seres sobrenaturales que se apiñan en la cabecera del yacente.*

---

On one side:

- The Trinity
- The Virgin
- The heavenly court

On the other:

- Satan
  - The army of monstrous demons
- 

The change is significant: *la gran concentración que en los siglos XII y XIII tenía lugar al final de los tiempos se produce a partir de ahora, en el siglo XV, en la habitación del enfermo.*<sup>29</sup> In addition, we are no longer before a trial but before a fight. God ceases to be a judge to become a referee. The balance is no longer useful, only favorable or unfavorable accounts for the deceased. This struggle can have two interpretations: either as the cosmic struggle between the powers of good and evil that dispute the possession of the dying person who attends as a stranger; or as the last test or temptation of the dying person arbitrated by God and his court.<sup>30</sup> In this second case:

---

27 Baschet, 2009: 430-431.

28 Ariès, 2000: 48.

29 Ariès, 2000: 48.

30 Ariès, 2000.

El moribundo verá su vida entera tal como está contenida en el libro, y será tentado, bien por la desesperación de sus faltas, bien por la vanagloria de sus buenas acciones, bien por el amor apasionado de las cosas y los seres. Su actitud [...] borrará de golpe todos los pecados de su vida si rechaza la tentación o, por el contrario, anulará todas sus buenas acciones si cede a ella. La última prueba ha reemplazado el Juicio Final.<sup>31</sup>

The terrified dying person can neither make any mistakes nor succumb to the final temptations that he faces in complete solitude, as no one in the room can perceive what he is seeing, what is happening.

## 2. SIGNIFICANT REFORMS AND RELEVANT COUNCILS

The twelfth century marks a before and after in the history of the Western Church by its separation from the Eastern Church. In addition, the economic power of the monasteries is reduced by the lower amount of donations and the development of both trade and cities. To counter this lack of income, behavior that enables the living to help the dead or themselves is established: *limosnas, donaciones para plegarias, donaciones para misas*.<sup>32</sup> But these aids, these mechanisms, already implemented before the end of the twelfth century, remained vague and mysterious as indicated by Le Goff: *El purgatorio fue la explicación. Selló definitivamente la solidaridad de la humanidad, la unión en el espacio y en el tiempo*<sup>33</sup> with its appearance in the thirteenth century. This mixture of worlds, this supportive relationship between the living and the dead, has a character and a legal implication that helps to understand its scope because:

Hasta el purgatorio, la vida y la muerte separaban el fuero eclesiástico y el fuero divino, el poder de jurisdicción de la Iglesia y el de Dios. Los vivos respondían ante el tribunal de la Iglesia, los muertos ante el de Dios. Con el purgatorio, la jurisdicción se volvía mixta. La Iglesia tiene influencia más allá de la muerte.<sup>34</sup>

The noun *purgatorium*, Purgatory, appears in the last third of the twelfth century,<sup>35</sup> in a period of *grand remaniement cartographique*

31 Ariès, 2000: 49.

32 Jacques Le Goff, *En busca de la Edad Media*, Barcelona, Paidós, 2003: 146.

33 Le Goff, 2003: 104.

34 Le Goff, 2003.

35 Jacques Le Goff, *Lo maravilloso y lo cotidiano en el Occidente medieval*, Barcelona, Gedisa, 1985: 44.

between 1150 and 1300. *Quand on attend la résurrection des morts, la géographie de l'autre monde n'est pas une affaire secondaire. [...] Car les deux espaces sont liés à travers les relations qui unissent société des morts et société des vivants.*<sup>36</sup> This interspace is situated, from the point of view of time, between individual death and the Final Judgment and, from the point of view of space, between Heaven and Hell, replacing the pre-havens of *refrigerium* and Abraham's bosom<sup>37</sup> (16-17) that, in a state of almost paradisiacal bliss, welcomed the deceased until the arrival of judgment at the end of time while Purgatory does so only until the end of expiation<sup>38</sup> (71 and 73). The tripartite geography of the beyond prevents continuing talking about two lives and two deaths, as was the case until the end of the twelfth century, to begin referring to three types of lives:

- Life on Earth
- Life of Glory enjoyed by the soul, separate from the body, after physical death
- Eternal life that both soul and body enjoy after the resurrection of the flesh
- Similarly, there will be three types of deaths:
- The first death or physical death, common to all mankind by original sin
- The second death of the soul death that occurs after the appearance of the new particular judgment which takes place at the time of death
- The third death which takes place after the Final Judgment and the Resurrection of the flesh and equally affects both the soul and the body.<sup>39</sup>

In a moment of effort to rebuild the Church divided into two because of the schism, it was intended that the Eastern Church accepted the idea of this halfway place. To do this, Innocent IV sent a letter to the authorities of the Church of Cyprus in 1254. This letter is considered by Jacques Le

---

36 Le Goff, 1981: 14.

37 Le Goff, 1981: 16-17.

38 Le Goff, 1981: 71 and 73.

39 Tomás González Rolán; Pilar Saquero Suárez-Somonte y José Joaquín Caerols Pérez, *Ars moriendi: el «Ars moriendi» en sus versiones latina, castellana y catalana: introducción, edición crítica y estudio*, Madrid, Ediciones Clásicas, 2008: 19-20.

Goff as the birth certificate of the Purgatory.<sup>40</sup> This year the First Council of Lyon was held, but it is necessary to wait until 1274, date of the Second Council of Lyon summoned by Gregory X, for the doctrinal formulation.<sup>41</sup>

The transition from collective to individual judgment finds a decisive ally in auricular confession with the arrival of the thirteenth century, since *la confesión anual privada o de viva voz se hace obligatoria. Así pues, cada cual debe examinar sus faltas y manifestarlas para que el sacerdote determine la penitencia que se les debe aplicar.*<sup>42</sup>

Por medio de ella, se impondrá esa «pastoral del miedo», de la que ha hablado Jean Delumeau:<sup>43</sup> la idea que se intenta difundir es que la confesión —seguida de la absolución final— es el camino privilegiado para entrar a la gloria paradisíaca, con lo cual la Iglesia queda como intermediaria obligada para que se produzca esta posibilidad. A la inversa, no hay salvación posible sin mediar el recurso eclesiástico.<sup>44</sup>

In the Fourth Lateran Council (1215), Innocent III will approve the creation of the mendicant orders of the Dominicans and Franciscans whose confessor manuals helped lay the foundations of auricular confession.<sup>45</sup>

### 3. THE STEP FROM FINAL JUDGMENT TO INDIVIDUAL JUDGMENT IN LITERATURE

The preponderance of a collective Final Judgment at the end of time will dwindle in favor of an individual judgment immediately after death and even previously. This evolution will encourage believers to be open to new rites in order to ensure their salvation in the hereafter and the devotion to celestial mediators for the same purpose. The deeply held beliefs in a collective judgment at the end of time now compete with new theological

40 Le Goff, 1981: 379-380.

41 Minois, 1994: 231.

42 Minois 1994: 227.

43 See Delumeau, Jean, *Le péché et la peur: La culpabilisation en Occident (XIII<sup>e</sup>-XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècles)*, Paris, Fayard, 1983: 369 y ss.

44 Ariel Guance, *Los discursos sobre la muerte en la Castilla medieval (siglos VII-XV)*, Valladolid, Junta de Castilla y León, 1998: 52.

45 Le Goff, 2003: 34 and 57-58.

truths<sup>46</sup> such as the appearance of Purgatory, the mixed jurisdiction<sup>47</sup> and the individual *post mortem* judgment. The serenity to face death without hesitation or fears by knowingly being saved through baptism barely comes into practice until the thirteenth century.<sup>48</sup> From the literary point of view, this serenity includes everything from legends and Hispanic epic poems to the *Poema del Cid*, the *Book of Fernan Gonçalez* and the fragment of *Roncesvalles* in the second half of this century. However, during the thirteenth century, this calm coexists with Marian and Saints mediations, and the mentions to the Purgatory found in the work of Berceo. However, this is not true in other contemporary works in *cuaderna vía* such as the *Libro de Alexandre* and the *Libro de Apolonio*. According to Fernando Martínez Gil,<sup>49</sup> with the end of the thirteenth century a first period ends in which we face a still gentle death reflected in all these works, deprived of its drama, doubt and fear, with a predominance of good about unfortunate deaths. The deaths presented give way, almost accidentally, to a later existence whose true test will take place at the end of time during the Final Judgment; which links them to the Tamed Death of Philippe Ariès.<sup>50</sup> According to Susana Royer de Cardinal, the sweetness and serenity reflected in the 13th century Berceo's literature will give way in the 14th century to a literature reflecting *el ansia de los apetitos terrenales* and *de los goces sensuales* and recording *un cierto pesimismo*.<sup>51</sup>

The second period defended by Martínez Gil covers the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. In the fourteenth century, the *Libro del buen amor*, announcing the beginning of secularization,<sup>52</sup> and the original wording of the *Danza general de la muerte*<sup>53</sup> present the personification of death as a terrible being that lurks menacingly and will reach an obsessive role not only in literature but also in art and the sermons of preachers. Death is

---

46 Luis Martínez Falero, «El tema de la muerte en la literatura popular europea: las danzas de la muerte y sus implicaciones doctrinales», *Revista Cálamo FASPE*, 58, 2011: 59.

47 See note Le Goff, 2003: 104.

48 Fernando Martínez Gil, *La Muerte Viva. Muerte y Sociedad en Castilla durante la Baja Edad Media*, Toledo, Diputación Provincial de Toledo, 1996: 22-23.

49 Martínez Gil, 1996: 22.

50 Ariès, 2000: 24.

51 Susana Royer de Cardinal, *Morir en España. (Castilla Baja Edad Media)*, Buenos Aires, Universidad Católica Argentina, 1992: 283.

52 Martínez Gil, 1996: 22.

53 According to Infantes, the original wording of the *Danza general de la muerte* can be dated between 1360 and 1390, while the manuscript, the El Escorial codex where it is collected, is dated around 1440-1450 (Victor Infantes: 230).

individualized even more and ends up painting a new model that Ariès calls “One’s Own Death”<sup>54</sup> that precedes an individual *post mortem* judgment before the purgative period. Although the Church retains his speech, it is no longer *reposado ni parece seguro de su aceptación general* but tense and uncertain that makes them explode *lo macabro con el inconfesado objetivo de apuntalar el orden social y preservar la inmovilidad estamental*.<sup>55</sup> According to Fernando Martínez Gil,<sup>56</sup> the interest that moves *desde el Juicio final definitivo al purgatorio provisional, desde el fin de los tiempos al largo período que se extiende entre la muerte individual y la Parusía* gives greater prominence to physical death.

In the fifteenth century, the *Ars moriendi* goes a step further and presents an individual judgment before death, before the separation of body and soul caused by death.

#### 4. REFLECTION IN THE LITERATURE OF SOME SIGNIFICANT REFORMS

##### 4.1. A binary geography to ternary geography

The binary division of the afterlife (Heaven-Hell) coexists with the preponderance of the Final Judgment to be held after a waiting period in heavenly peace. With the arrival of Purgatory to replace the peace of the righteous, the binary division is discarded to fit a ternary division that will change the habits of believers conditioning their lives in favor of those who already dwell in him as well as their attitude to face death before said possibility of purgation.

With regard to the appearance of the term ‘Purgatory’ in literature, Mira Miralles remembers that there is a dividing line between the absence of the term before the thirteenth century, not to mention some notable exceptions, and the settlement of the term from the fourteenth century where the writings cite it *como un lugar concreto donde es llevada el alma al separarse del cuerpo*.<sup>57</sup> Martínez Gil also emphasizes the absence of the term, since neither

54 Ariès, 2000, 61.

55 Martínez Gil, 1996, 22.

56 Martínez Gil, 1996: 59.

57 Isabel Mira Miralles, «‘Muerte que a todos convida’: La muerte en la literatura hispánica medieval», *Revista de lenguas y literaturas catalana, gallega y vasca*, 14, 2008-2009: 317.

in the *Libro de Alexandre*, nor in the *Libro de Fernán González* or in the *Poema de Mio Cid* —*obras en las que el paraíso y los infiernos se reparten todas las alusiones*— we find the word Purgatory, but he warns that there is a single exception, since Berceo uses the word only once and in the plural.<sup>58</sup>

Here are some examples of our literature that corroborate the absence of the term. In the *Poema de Mio Cid* we found “çielo” (vv. 217, 330, 331, 614, 1942, 2037, 2126, 2155, 3281, 3452, 3714), “Paraíso” (v. 350 and the *explicit*) and “infiernos” (359 v.); in the case of the *Libro de Fernán González* they cited the çielo several times, either as a place where those who have suffered martyrdom are directly transferred to (c. 13d), or as a place where the king Goths are promoted without previous trial, just as the martyrs are, or as a resting place where the righteous await the Final Judgment (c.25ab) or as a place where God lives (v. 59a) or from where He descends (c. 112a). We also find the word *mundo mejor* (170ab c.), *paraýso* —perhaps the lower paradise mentioned by Delumeau— (cc 32cd, 125b, 543-544c.) and *infierno* (382cd c.).

The fragment of *Roncesvalles* mentions *buen logare* when Charlemagne finds his dead nephew (vv. 40-41) and when the duc Aymon finds his son don Rynalte (v. 92). Neither Charlemagne nor the duc Aymon have fear of the future that awaits Rynalte or Roldan in the hereafter, since the serenity of a calm awaiting of the Final Judgment still remains.

Even in the fourteenth century, as Garrosa Resina indicates,<sup>59</sup> the *Poema de Alfonso XI* shows in lines 1532 and 1535 how every soldier who dies in the battle against Abul Hasan *obtendrá la gloria del paraíso (sin necesidad de ninguna purificación previa en el más allá)*. Such purification would take place in Purgatory. The extinct immediate salvation provided by being holy through baptism (1535cd) is equated to the obtained salvation through death in holy crusade, as it happened through the bloodshed of martyrs. This equation, without a period of purgation to reach Heaven that text quotes, comes at a time when the salvation achieved by the mere fact of being baptized had to be criticized and considered heresy since 1240.<sup>60</sup>

However, literature still reflects the wait without purgation in the thirteenth century. In the *Libro de Alexandre* we found a passage about the punishment inflicted on the *inclusi* or the Jews from the Caspian mountain

58 Martínez Gil, 1996: 56.

59 Antonio Garrosa Resina, *Magia y superstición en la literatura castellana medieval*, Valladolid, Universidad de Valladolid, Secretariado de Publicaciones, 1987: 256.

60 Jean Delumeau, *Historia del Paraíso*, vol. I, Madrid, Taurus, 2005: 79.

ranges (2102-2116). The strangers Jewish of those mountains, which can only be accessed by a gate, are locked up for life (2112) and boarded up by God, after Alexander's prayer (2114). There they await the arrival of the end of the world and the Final Judgment (2115). Nothing is said about what will happen to them from the moment of their death until the arrival of the Final Judgment. It merely indicates the wait without any mention of purgation:

Pero diz'el escrito,	que bien es de creer,
fasta la fin del mundo	que han y de yazer;
avrán, cerca la fin,	ende a estorçer:
¡avrán el mundo todo	en quexa a meter! (2115)

In a similar vein, the *Libro de Apolonio* shows, after the death of the protagonist, a reflection on life and death that reflects the calm and the confidence when appearing before God after death. In this way, line 655d cites the "banquet" prepared by God for them away from any period of purgation at the intermediate location.

Regarding Heaven and Hell, the *Libro de Alexandre* describes them after the voyage to the bottom of the sea of the protagonist and two of his servants. Faced with such arrogance as to pretend to know as much as God (2327-2328), Nature prepares its revenge by descending into Hell. At that moment we see its description and also the description of Heaven (2334-2345). The description of a definitive Heaven and Hell, expressly created by God, is evident in stanzas 2338 and 2417. Although, the use of the future tense in line 2337a and stanza 2338 refers to Heaven, in stanzas 2342 and 2414 the present tense refers to Hell. Furthermore, although Purgatory is not mentioned the distinction of sentences and their sufferings is made (2413-2414); either because it is indirectly describing the incipient Purgatory or because there are definite sentences rather than definitive places. It is in that discriminating context that stanza 2420 speaks about the limbo where the souls of the children go and the righteous remained before the visit of Jesus Christ. In my view, all reflect a new geography which slowly developed throughout the thirteenth century.

Meanwhile, the study of *Los Milagros de Nuestra Señora* of Berceo by François Cazal<sup>61</sup> shows both the geography of the beyond before the

61 François Cazal, «Características y articulación del espacio del mundo terrenal y del espacio del más allá en los Milagros de Nuestra Señora», en Francisco Crosas López, ed., *La hermosa cobertura: lecciones de literatura medieval*, Ansoáin (Navarra), Eunsa, 2000: 72.

second council of Lyons in 1274 and the one that doctrinal formulation of Purgatory consolidated from that council. In his view, the text of Berceo refers to two areas where the narrative unfolds: the earthly space and space of the beyond. In the first space characters live and sin, while in the second space their actions are judged. The space of the beyond is subdivided into two spaces and two subspaces. The spaces would be the paradise of saints and the residence of devils, and the subspaces would be the resting place of the righteous and the Purgatory of sinners.

Once in the afterlife, the soul has four possibilities:

- The paradise of the saints, Heaven.
- The residence of devils, Hell.
- The peace of the righteous.
- The Purgatory of sinners.

The access of the soul to the paradise of the saints, to the happiness of the blessed, is cited in the IV miracle (129) and the V miracle (138) through the immediate ascension of the soul.

However, coming down to the final Hell is not narrated as something that happens immediately, although the fact of *encontrarse brutalmente expuesta a los tormentos de los diablos* does as we read in the X miracle (246).<sup>62</sup> The final Hell is only briefly evoked in the II miracle (85d) when the desire of devils to take the soul of the fornicator sexton “al váratro, de deleit bien vazío” is described and also in the X miracle (247-248) when *Estevan* sees the soul of his brother *Peidro* in Purgatory which is located close to Hell. Hell is also cited in XXV miracle (847) where *Teófilo* implores the Virgin to rescue the letter he signed with the devil from that place. This request provokes the indignation of the Virgin.<sup>63</sup>

According to Cazal,<sup>64</sup> the peace of the righteous seems to be described in the introduction of *Milagros*, as it details a place with different characteristics to that where the Virgin and the saints dwell. This haven of peace, this perfect quiet of the *prado, verde e bien sencido, de flores bien poblado* (2BC), is far from the turmoil of the beyond and the turmoil of the world of humans. This similarity of turmoils reflects the humanized vision of the

---

62 Cazal, 2000: 75.

63 Cazal, 2000: 75-76.

64 Cazal, 2000: 79 and 99.

thirteenth century on the heavenly powers and makes them more attainable. Although this place is compared with the paradise of Adam and Eve in the introduction of *Milagros* (14 and 15), it is not the same place because *aquí se disfruta de un descanso logrado tras una vida de trabajos, [...] de esfuerzos por ganar la salvación*.<sup>65</sup> In the geography of the beyond during the Middle Ages, this green meadow is equivalent to *limbum patrum*,<sup>66</sup> a sort of waiting room or antechamber of paradise, which only the righteous will access after the Final Judgment.<sup>67</sup> The belief in this resting and waiting place is still present in the Purgatory of St. Patrick, an important medieval text dating later than 1190,<sup>68</sup> however this belief in an antechamber of the authentic paradise will eventually be considered heresy and criticized for the first time in 1240 by the University of Paris.<sup>69</sup> This fact reflects its subsequent collapse and the consequent empowerment of the belief in Purgatory during the years of Berceo's literary creation.

However, unlike the resting place of the righteous, Purgatory is described many times, although it is only cited by its name once and in plural in the X miracle (241ab) when the death of *Peidro* and *Estevan* is narrated:

Murió el cardenal,	don Peidro el onrado,
fo a los purgatorios,	do merecié, levado;
ante de pocos días	fo Estevan finado,
atendí tal judizio	cual él lo avié dado. (241)

It is the only time the word Purgatory is cited and besides in plural. In this miracle Berceo describes a different end for each of the brothers. While Peter, the cardinal, receives the comfort of a papal Mass to relieve his stay in Purgatory (251), Esteban, condemned to Hell (246), rises again for 30 days after the intercession of the Virgin and St. Project (257). After this period of penance, Esteban dies in peace (269). We have two different possibilities for two different brothers.

As Cazal explains,<sup>70</sup> Purgatory is a place from which characters can return to the world of the living to do penance through the intercession of

65 Cazal, 2000: 95.

66 Delumeau, 2005: 72.

67 Cazal, 2000: 95.

68 Delumeau, 2005: 77.

69 Delumeau, 2005: 79.

70 Delumeau, 2005: 79.

the Virgin or a place where they can purge their sins after death. In the first case, it is a penance in life as Saint Gregory conceived<sup>71</sup> and can be found in miracles II, VII, VIII and X. In the second case, the soul can benefit from the prayer of the living as happens to the cardinal in the X miracle. However, in a totally extraordinary way, the protagonist could access Heaven—or the resting place of the righteous—from Purgatory after one year of stay as takes place in the XII miracle (289B, 297). What we are informed about Purgatory is that the torments of definitive Hell itself are experienced in this place and are applied by the devils themselves (246-247).<sup>72</sup>

If this is so, it is confusing how the miraculous resurrections resulting from the Marian intercession to guarantee the salvation of the soul on the Final Judgment Day are mixed with the benefits that, though in smaller numbers, the denizens of Purgatory can obtain from the world of the living to alleviate their suffering and reduce the period of purgation, thus also achieving the desired salvation. Even the transfer without trial from Purgatory to Heaven or a better place is mentioned because the Virgin *ovo pesar e duelo del mal* that the purger was suffering (XII, 296c). However, this vagueness and even confusion about Purgatory and its contingencies seems to characterize the thirteenth century. We are in the period of consolidation of this third place that culminates in its doctrinal formulation in 1274, dated after the drafting of all Berceo's texts.

In the late thirteenth or early fourteenth century,<sup>73</sup> the *Libro de miseria de omne* cites Paradise in stanza 168 but not Purgatory as one would expect from its dating. However, we did find a comprehensive and detailed description of Hell and its various tortures and stay depending on the sins committed<sup>74</sup> as might be expected due to the iconographic development during the fourteenth century. Among stanzas 473 and 483 nine hellish tortures inflicted in nine different places are described which can be found in the passage entitled *Quod in inferno IX spiciales penis that leguntur*. Subsequently the corresponding behaviors and deadly sins for each of the infernal punishments will be cited between stanzas 484 and 493. The two

---

71 Mira Miralles, 2008-2009: 317.

72 Cazal, 2000: 75-76.

73 Jaime Cuesta Serrano, ed., *Libro de miseria de omne*, Madrid, Cátedra, 2012: 38.

74 Félix A. Ferrer García, «La muerte individualizada en la vida cotidiana y en la literatura medieval castellana (siglo XI-XV)», *Espacio, Tiempo y Forma. Serie III, Hª Medieval*, 20, 2007: 114.

fragments are interrelated. Each hellish torture (473-483) corresponds to a specific sin (484-493). Thus, the greedy man will suffer eternal hellfire. Whoever departs from God in word or deed, the frightful cold; the envious man will suffer worms, snakes and dragons swimming in the hellfire; the lustful, the great stink; the soul of man who does not hear the Word of God will be beaten by devils; the man who gives himself up to the darkness of vice not trusting God will suffer the hellish darkness; the man who does not want to confess, will be shown his sins written by the devil himself in his own handwriting and will have to account for them; the man who does not go to hear sermons will have terrible visions and torments and, finally, every sinner will be bound hand and foot with ropes and chains of fire and thrown to the pains of Hell. After detailing the deadly sins, we found in the *Libro de miseria de omne* a similar subdivision within the infernal geography.

If something differentiates thirteenth century and fourteenth century literature it is the specific mention of the term Purgatory. Except for the citation found in Berceo's X miracles (the two brothers), the word hardly appears in the thirteenth century. However in the literature of the fourteenth century, the term and geographical location are already consolidated.<sup>75</sup> Regarding the *Libro de Buen Amor* by Juan Ruiz, we found several mentions to the three places. Three of them are in the *planh* for Trotaconventos where both the terms hellish place (1553a) and Hell (1558c) as Heaven, paradise in this case (1564a), are cited. Heaven appears as the place where Jesus Christ, who conquered death after dying at its hands (1556), dwells with all those who expectantly from the beginning of time, were released after His descent into Hell, where some remained (1563-1565). Hell is also cited as Death's abode (1552-1553).

The third place, where the soul goes after death in order to purge its sins, is cited after the first confrontation between *Mr. Carnal* and *Ms. Lent*. After the first was caught, we witness the episode *De la penitencia qu'el flaire dio a Don Carnal e de cómo el pecador se debe confessar e quién ha poder de lo absolver*. Speaking about the penance imposed on *Mr. Carnal* we find the word in line 1140b. Not only the place but also its purging ability is cited. It is important to remember how confession manuals of the late Middle Ages stressed the importance of the external manifestations of repentance for obtaining forgiveness from the Church.

---

75 Mira Miralles, 2008-2009: 317.

Unlike God, this Church could be deceived in regard to sincere repentance of the believer. Therefore the immediate forgiveness granted by God to true contrition was not effective until an authorized minister executed it. We must also remember how forgiveness affected only guilt, leaving the atonement pending. To satisfy atonement and to achieve full cleansing that allowed achieving the vision of God in Heaven, it was necessary to remain a certain time in Purgatory after the time of death. The fragment comprised between the stanzas 1138 and 1142 accounts for all of that.

The *Libro de los Estados* by don Juan Manuel cites the term in Chapter XLVII:

[...] mas el alma del home que en este mundo fizo mal, purgarlo ha en Purgatorio, et después que fuere purgado, yrá a-Parayso do será salvo.

Contrary to what you might expect, the *Dança General de la Muerte* does not mention the middle place; however, Heaven and Hell are cited. We found two references to the first one in the dialogue with the monk (52a-d) and the hermit (61c-d) although the term used is holy kingdom. In contrast to the monk, we find his secular representative, the usurer, who is the only one who is expressly condemned to Hell for Death (55a-d); possibly to mark more emphatically the good conduct of his correlative ecclesiastical representative. We also find references to Hell in the dialogue with the duke (22e-h) and the archbishop (24h).

Meanwhile, the *Ars moriendi* does contain several references to the three spaces. With respect to Heaven, it is cited in the proem and Chapters VI, VII, VIII and X. Hell appears in Chapters III and VIII, while Purgatory is cited in Chapter VI. This is an indirect reference because it is used to make a comparison between the purification endured in that place and the attitude the dying person must adopt before the temptation of impatience associated with the pains of the disease:

Por ende, esta tu enfermedad que es leve por respeto de tus pecados, non te pese, ante la sufre con buen corazón, ca sepas que es como e a manera de purgatorio, si ante de la muerte con buena paciencia se toma e es sufrida segund conviene de buena mente e con agradescimiento.

With similar meaning we find another citation of Purgatory, but this time in the Spanish translation of the archetype of the two versions of the *Ars moriendi: De scientia mortis*. The text refers to a mercantile attitude towards penalties to be purged, where you can subtract a part from the total to avoid suffering in Purgatory:

Acuérdate, hermano, con mucha solicitud cómo biviendo has offendido a tu Señor Dios muchas y diversas vezes, por lo qual te has a infinita pena obligado. E por tanto debes sufrir con mucha paciencia la pena que esta enfermedad te da y la muerte quando viniere. Rogando a nuestro Señor Dios que los trabajos que padeces sean en remisión de tus pecados, e por su infinita piedad tome estas penas que passas en descuento de las que en Purgatorio havías de padecer, porque muy mejor te es aquí sufrir qualquier pena que non en la otra vida<sup>76</sup>.

## 4.2. The body-soul duality and the Final Judgment in literature

Everything about the beyond and the judgment at the end of time is rooted and grounded in the body-soul duality and, from the thirteenth century, in the consolidation of Purgatory and the intercessory power of the Virgin and the saints.

The body-soul duality acquires its importance just as much from their separation that occurs at the time of death as from their reunification at the end of times before the celebration of the Final Judgment. Likewise, through the consolidation of Purgatory in the thirteenth century, it is guaranteed that the interferences by the world of the living in the world of the dead and vice versa are possible, allowing the reduction of penalty to purge for those disembodied souls that inhabit it and guaranteeing a favorable judgment on the Final Judgment Day once they are reunited with their bodies.

Prior to this interference, the option to appeal to the intercession of the Virgin or the saints existed for the soul of the deceased in order to get a second chance by means of a temporary resurrection. The believer, once resurrected, could solve everything in life to ensure his salvation on the Final Judgment Day without having to rely on the interference of the living to achieve this through his prayers.

We can find an example in Berceo's II miracle: *El Sacristán Fornicario* (75-100), where we find this impudent sexton and the Virgin interceding for him. The passage between stanzas 85 and 91 is the lawsuit between devils and angels for the soul of the deceased, whose body—submerged in the river—had been discovered by the monks. I want to emphasize the fact that the miracle, as Saugnieux points out,<sup>77</sup> *no es más que el relato del*

76 González Rolán, *et al.*, 2008: 160.

77 Joël Saugnieux, «La economía de la salvación en los Milagros de Nuestra Señora», en Joël Saugnieux, *Berceo y las culturas del siglo XIII*, Logroño, Servicio de Cultura de la Excma. Diputación Provincial, 1982b: 22.

*largo proceso que opone a la Virgen contra Satanás* for which Berceo uses only legal vocabulary in this lawsuit between angels and devils for the soul of the deceased. Proof of this legal language are the words: *razón de vozealla, sabidor, vozero, alcalde derechero* and *decreto*, terms consistent with the outlook that began to break into the iconography of tympana of the twelfth century and was fully developed in the thirteenth century. The scene includes, between stanzas 85 and 91, the elements of the iconography inspired by Matthew as well as separation or soul-body duality that we want to emphasize.

In the end the sexton rises again (94) and repents, thereby obtaining his second chance to confess and do penance for salvation of his soul (99) on the Final Judgment Day.

Similarly, the VIII miracle also uses legal terminology in a scene of similar characteristics in which demons and Santiago stand before the Virgin to determine whether the pilgrim's death is the result of suicide, indicating that demons would have won the lawsuit. In the end, the Virgin determines, with the approval of her Son, that the soul should return to the body as in the previous miracle bringing about the pilgrim's salvation (208-209).

In the VII miracle (172), we also find the Marian intercession that presents resurrection as a method to accomplish in life the necessary penance to ensure the salvation of the soul on the Final Judgment Day. Do not forget that almost all *Milagros* are built on the intervention of God or the Virgin who, after the death of the protagonist, granted his salvation, as Saugnieux points out,<sup>78</sup> *frecuentemente inesperada y a veces incluso inmerecida* through a miracle.

The *Libro de miseria de omne* also reflects this duality in many stanzas such as 203 and 204 pertaining to *De carcere corporis e anime* paragraph in which the soul is locked in the prison of the body. Likewise, after the resurrection of the flesh, those who end up in Hell will suffer punishment not only within their bodies, but also in their disembodied souls as shown in the *De insaciabili angustia danatorum* fragment (439-444) or the *De confusione peccatorum* fragment (447-448). On judgment day, the *Libro de miseria de omne* says, the damned will be handed over to the Devil

---

78 Joël Saugnieux, «Berceo y el Apocalipsis», en Joël Saugnieux, *Berceo y las culturas del siglo XIII*, Logroño, Servicio de Cultura de la Excma. Diputación Provincial, 1982a: 12.

irrevocably and without any chance of escape from the torments of Hell (154, 157 and 158). In order to avoid this, the *Libro* proposes penance (160) as a means of avoiding such condemnation (168).

In the case of the *Libro de Buen Amor*, when talking about the sin of *Açidia*, we are reminded how this sin adversely affects both the body and the soul:

Nunca está baldío aquel que una vez atas,  
fázesle pensar engaños, muchas malas baratas,  
deléitase en pecados e en malas baratas;  
con tus malas maestrías almas e cuerpos matas. (318)

Moving forward in time, the *Ars moriendi* also reflects this duality. Telling us about the short version (QS) or —as Idelfonso Adeva also names it— xylographic version,<sup>79</sup> Ruiz Garcia points out the five temptations that the dying will be subjected to along with the five beneficial hearings or consolation that could be received from the angel before the soul and the body are separated because of death.<sup>80</sup> After these ten scenes, the latest shows us a monk helping the dying to hold a lit candle in his hands. On expiring, the *éid lon* comes out of his mouth with his last breath. Angels welcome this spirit with the appearance of a naked boy.<sup>81</sup> It is at this precise moment that the soul separates from the body, which means that the trial celebrated at the deathbed took place before this disintegration; meanwhile both halves of the human still constitute a single being.

### 4.3. A collective Final Judgment on an individual judgment *pre mortem*

The Final Judgment is still being maintained at the end of time despite the appearance of individual *post mortem* judgment. What is modified is the interval of time between them. The state of the almost paradisiacal joy of pre-havens *refrigerium* and Abraham's bosom is replaced by a period of purgation in the third place that guarantees salvation for believers in the Final Judgment. After the first trial, the soul will know its fate in a new

79 Ildefonso Adeva Martin, «Los ‘Artes de Bien Morir’ en España antes del maestro Venegas», *Scripta theologica. Revista de la facultad de teología de la universidad de Navarra*, vol. XVI/1-2, Pamplona, 1984: 406.

80 Elisa Ruiz García, «El *Ars moriendi*: una preparación para el tránsito», en *IX Jornadas Científicas sobre Documentación: La muerte y sus testimonios escritos*, Madrid, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, 2011: 321.

81 Ruiz García, 2011: 337.

beyond which has adopted a ternary division that seems to eliminate the rest of the righteous that, in the case of Berceo, still seems to be in the introduction of *Milagros*.

Regarding the description of the Final Judgment, Berceo displays it in several of his works. It is important to remember that there are two mutually exclusive traditions on it. The one that stresses the sudden and unexpected character of the arrival of Judgment and the one that insists on the prior warning signs of its arrival. The first one is part of the preaching of Christ and can be found in Luke 17:20-37. The second belongs thematically to the most primitive Church and can be found in the apocalypse narrated by Mark (13:3-37) and developed by Matthew (24:16-25 and 46). Berceo's *Los Signos del Juicio Final* is located in the latter tradition developed by Matthew, by Paul (2 Tesa. 2:1-12) and also by John in the book of Revelation.<sup>82</sup> According to Joachim Jeremias, the text Matthew includes is *un apocalipsis judío que la iglesia primitiva, modificándolo y ampliándolo, puso en labios de Jesús*.<sup>83</sup>

In the largest part of *Los Signos* (22-59), Berceo develops the divine judgment with the words that God addresses to the righteous and the damned gathered around him and with the description of rewards and punishments.<sup>84</sup> Speaking about the thirteenth sign before judgment, he shows how, before all are judged, those who are still alive will suddenly die to immediately rise again and attend the trial in company of the others (20).

After this resurrection, the fifteenth and last sign will come. At the sound of the trumpet, all will be summoned regardless of whether they are children, adults (*egüados*) or elders. Then, once their bodies and souls are reunited (52), they will appear before the judge with the same age, thirty years old (24), in honor of the Trinity. *Los Signos* describe the separation of all the righteous and the sinners, including Judas, who have been waiting throughout the time that has elapsed between his death and the trial (25-26). After him, the devils, who were lurking, will take the damned (36).

---

82 Saugnieux, 1982a: 164-165.

83 Joachim Jeremias, *Teología del Nuevo Testamento*, vol. I. Salamanca, Ediciones Sígueme, 1985: 151.

84 Miguel Ángel Pérez Priego, «Berceo y las postrimerías del hombre», en L. Funes y I. L. Moure, eds., *Studia in Honorem Germán Orduna*, Alcalá de Henares, Universidad de Alcalá, 2001: 526.

It is important to point out that, although in *Los Signos* Judas had waited for the arrival of the Final Judgment with the rest of deceased, stanza 441 of the *Libro de Fernán Gonçález* shows Judas already dwelling in Hell where everyone who has fled from the battlefield will unite.

Stanzas 170-173 of *Loores de Nuestra Señora* also show this vision of the Final Judgment characterized by the presence of all mankind in adulthood, in the presence of the majesty of the Son showing his wounds and his cross,<sup>85</sup> as it appeared in the iconography of the cathedral tympana in its representation of the *arma Christi*.

Reflecting a turbulent period with regard to religious beliefs, I want to note the presence in the *Loores de Nuestra Señora* of the tetramorph that characterizes those representations of the Final Judgment prior to the twelfth century. Such representations litigated with matthean ones during this century to end up losing the tympana strife in the thirteenth century. However, Berceo reflected it in his poem in equal conditions to the victorious court of the apostles of the matthean Final Judgment. The four figures of the tetramorfos symbolizing the evangelists are cited between stanzas 164 and 168 in addition to its crucial role in the Judgment. At the same time the court of the apostles appears in stanzas 162, 163 and 169.

With the arrival of the fourteenth century, the description of *post mortem* judgment and death itself gained preponderance just like its individual character against the collective one of the Final Judgment. The personification of death we found in the *Dança General de la Muerte* — obsessive protagonist of literature, art and sermons of preachers during the fourteenth and fifteenth century— strengthened both the process of individualization of the trial as dying itself for which the *Ars moriendi* texts will be necessary.<sup>86</sup> These texts promoted the mediating role of the Church and strengthened the resources for the intercessors as well as the sacraments that were often rejected by the faithful, especially the extreme unction.<sup>87</sup>

This individualization of dying is represented through the successive dialogues compiled in the *Dança*. These dialogues arise from the conversations between the characters and the personification of death as the

---

85 García de la Concha, 1992: 70.

86 Martínez Gil, 1996: 25.

87 Florence Bayard, *L'art du bien mourir au XV<sup>e</sup> siècle*, Paris, Preses de l'Université de Paris-Sorbonne, 1999: 77.

main character who was given the name of “Death”.<sup>88</sup> Each of the characters initiates a face to face encounter with the figure of the protagonist, not collectively but individually.

According to González Rolán, Saquero Suárez-Somonte and Caerols Pérez, the *Ars moriendi* were not intended to cause fear of physical death but of second death, the death of the soul, —one of two possibilities after the particular judgment— that inexorably led to eternal damnation without due repentance.<sup>89</sup> According to Elisa Ruiz García,<sup>90</sup> both the collective judgment at the end of time and The Book of Life, which contained the names of the blessed, no longer come into force at this time:

Ahora impera una concepción economicista e individualizada: una figura angélica tiene un registro en el que se apuntan las buenas acciones de cada individuo. A su vez un representante de Satanás controla los pecados cometidos. En el instante de la muerte se asiste a un juicio en el cual se coteja el activo y el pasivo del balance.

The council related in time to the appearance of the *DG* and the *Ars moriendi* is the Ecumenical Council of Constance (5-11-1414 to 22-4-1418) in which the official text of *Ars* was enacted.<sup>91</sup>

This council ended the Great Western Schism (1378-1418) with the election of Cardinal Colonna as the only pope of Christianity with the name of Martin V on 11 October 1417. The Ecumenical Council of Constance decided to use the newly enacted *Artes moriendi* for preaching about the end of life<sup>92</sup> and the individual judgment that accompanies it.

His enormous popularity, both in his original essays and in his translations of the various European vernaculars, would not have been possible without the intervention of the mendicant orders of the Dominicans and the Franciscans<sup>93</sup> and without the spreading and support of belief in individual judgment.<sup>94</sup>

---

88 Carina Zubillaga, «La configuración de la muerte en el *Libro de buen amor* como huella textual de un mundo en crisis», *Revista de poética medieval*, 13 (2004): 55-56.

89 González Rolán, *et al.* 2008: 21.

90 Ruiz García, 2011: 321.

91 Ashby Kinch, *Imago Mortis. Mediating Images of Death in Late Medieval Culture*, Leiden-Boston, Brill, 2013: 35.

92 González Rolán *et al.*, 2008: 22.

93 González Rolán *et al.*, 2008: 22-23.

94 González Rolán *et al.*, 2008: 42.

The *Ars moriendi*, or short version, achieves a perfect connection between text and images. The text tries to teach them to die well while defending themselves from the temptations of the devil in order to reach paradise, and the images enhance the text, but, by themselves, also make its contents visible<sup>95</sup>. Hence the similarity can be found between the *Danza de la muerte*, spread across Europe both in their mural iconographic representations as in the texts with or without images, and the *Ars moriendi*.

The short version of the *Ars moriendi* in his description of individual judgment cites five sins for each of the five temptations that the devil subjected to the dying. With its temptations, the devil will try to make the dying lose faith, become despairing, impatient, vain or yearn their past by distracting them in this way from the concentration needed to die in God's grace.<sup>96</sup> Five inspirations of the angel are alternately opposed at such temptations.

The five temptations we found are: disbelief, despair, impatience, pride-vainglory and avarice. To these five temptations, faith, hope, patience-charity, humility and rejection of the things of this world are opposed.

At first, the only judgment to be held for both the body and the soul, merged again after the resurrection of the flesh, would be held at the end of time. Later, we found a double judgment: the individual judgment *post mortem* and the Final Judgment. However, the *Ars moriendi* shows a new kind of judgment that includes features of both. On the one hand, it is an individual and not collective judgment as the *post mortem* judgment before the period of purgation; and, on the other hand, it is a judgment for both the soul and the body as will happen at the Final Judgment. The novelty proposed in the *Ars* is only possible by setting the judgment before the death of the believer when the soul and the body are still linked. In that case, it could be interpreted not only as the advancement of the judgment from the end of time to the later part of the believer's life, but also as the overcoming of the obstacle of physical death to celebrate it in the believer's life. Therefore, a bringing closer in time of the Final Judgment and a process of individuation occur at the same time.

95 González Rolán *et al.*, 2008: 25.

96 Rebeca Sanmartín Bastida, *El arte de morir. La puesta en escena de la muerte en un tratado del siglo XV*, Madrid, Iberoamericana, 2006: 16.

## 5. CONCLUSIONS

The remoteness of a Final Judgment to be held at the end of time after paradisiacal rest does not have the same effect on the believer's conscience who feels saved by baptism, as the proximity of an individual judgment just before dying and full of fears and tests. While the protagonists of many epics and thirteenth century texts, having covered their personal needs, die in peace awaiting Final Judgment which is lost in the distance of time, the *Ars moriendi* presents a judgment eclipsing the necessary composure in such a critical moment.

According to José Luis Bimbela Pedrola in citing Bayés<sup>97</sup> during the course on counseling entitled *Relationship Skills with the Affected by HIV/AIDS* celebrated in 1996:

Si las consecuencias (de una conducta) son placenteras de forma inmediata (aunque a largo plazo puedan ser negativas o incluso gravísimas) es más probable que la conducta se mantenga. Por el contrario, si las consecuencias son negativas de forma inmediata (aunque a largo plazo puedan ser positivas) es más probable que la conducta no se mantenga.

This would be a relevant fact to understand the behavioral amendment due to the remoteness or the proximity of judgment, since such amendment is directly related to the lapse between cause and effect. As Bimbela explained, if a sexual practice and its harmful consequences were consecutive (sexual act with infection or coitus with unwanted pregnancy), this practice or behavior would not be maintained over time, this habit would be changed. If the lapse between sexual intercourse and childbirth did not exist but happened consecutively, humans would change their sexual habits. It is the lapse—nine months for the pregnancy or several years for the onset of the severe symptoms of HIV/AIDS—which causes difficulties both in prevention guidelines and behavioral modification.

Similarly, in the present case, the extensive length of time between the death and the celebration of the Final Judgment, after a pleasant period of dormancy in peace, makes it lose its deterrent and capacity for behavioral modification, although the Final Judgment becomes negative for believers in the long run. For that reason, the Church decided to move judgment in

---

97 Ramón Bayés, *El reloj emocional: La gestión del tiempo interior*, Barcelona, Alienta Editorial, 2007: 73-79.

time by approaching it as close to death as possible and by searching the immediacy of its consequences. For this purpose the Church sets an individual judgment immediately after death while maintaining the collective judgment at the end of time; but, not pleased with the achievements “obtained”, decides to set the individual judgment before death. This ecclesial decision involves the disappearance of time between the act and its consequences, between believers’ behavior in life and the judgment for such behavior. When this lapse disappears, it is much more effective to control, to condition and to modify believers’ behavior.

## REFERENCES

- ADEVA MARTIN, Ildefonso, 1984, «Los ‘Artes de bien morir’ en España antes del maestro Venegas», *Scripta theologica. Revista de la facultad de teología de la universidad de Navarra*, vol. XVI/1-2, (1984): 405-415.
- ANGHEBEN, Marcello, 2007, *Le Jugement dernier entre Orient et Occident*. Pace, Valentino, dir. Paris, du Cerf.
- ARIÈS, Philippe, 2000, *Historia de la muerte en Occidente: desde la Edad Media hasta nuestros días*. Barcelona, El Acanalado.
- ARIÈS, Philippe, 2011, *El hombre ante la muerte*. Madrid, Taurus.
- BASCHET, Jérôme, 1993, *Les justices de l’au-delà: les représentations de l’enfer en France et en Italie (XII-XV siècles)*. Rome, École Française de Rome.
- BASCHET, Jérôme, 2009, *La civilización feudal. Europa del año mil a la colonización de América*. México, Fondo de Cultura Económica.
- BAYARD, Florence, 1999, *L’art du bien mourir au XV<sup>e</sup> siècle*. Paris, Presses de l’Université de Paris-Sorbonne.
- BAYÉS, Ramón, 2007, *El reloj emocional: La gestión del tiempo interior*. Barcelona, Alienta.
- BERCEO, Gonzalo de, [1992], «Los Signos del Juicio Final». Ed. de Michel García, en *Gonzalo de Berceo. Obra completa*, coord. Isabel Uría Maqua. Madrid, Espasa-Calpe: 1035-1061.
- BERCEO, Gonzalo de, [1992], *Obra completa*. Coord. Isabel Uría; eds. B. Maqua Dutton; A. Ruffinatto; P. Tesauro; I. Uría; C. García Turza; G. Orduna; N. Salvador; P. M. Cátedra y M. García. Madrid, Espasa-Calpe.
- CASAS RIGALL, Juan, ed., 2007, *Libro de Alexandre*. Madrid, Castalia.
- CAZAL, François, 2000, «Características y articulación del espacio del mundo terrenal y del espacio del más allá en los *Milagros de Nuestra Señora*». En Francisco Crosas López, ed., *La hermosa cobertura: lecciones de literatura medieval*. Ansoáin (Navarra), Eunsa: 71-100.
- CUESTA SERRANO, Jaime, ed., 2012, *Libro de miseria de omne*. Madrid, Cátedra.

- CHRISTE, Yves, 1969, *Les Grands Portails Romains*. Genève, Librairie Droz.
- DELUMEAU, Jean, 2005, *Historia del Paraíso*. Vol. I. Madrid, Taurus.
- FERRER GARCÍA, Félix A., 2007, «La muerte individualizada en la vida cotidiana y en la literatura medieval castellana (siglo XI-XV)», *Espacio, Tiempo y Forma. Serie III, Hª Medieval*, 20 (2007): 97-134.
- GARCÍA DE LA CONCHA, Víctor, 1992, «La mariología en Gonzalo de Berceo». En Gonzalo de Berceo, *Obra completa*, coord. Isabel Uría Maqua. Madrid, Espasa-Calpe: 61-87.
- GARROSA RESINA, Antonio, 1987, *Magia y superstición en la literatura castellana medieval*. Valladolid, Universidad, Secretariado de Publicaciones.
- GONZÁLEZ ROLÁN, Tomás, Pilar SAQUERO SUÁREZ-SOMONTE y José Joaquín CAEROLS PÉREZ, 2008, *Ars moriendi: el «Ars moriendi» en sus versiones latina, castellana y catalana: introducción, edición crítica y estudio*. Madrid, Ediciones Clásicas.
- GUIANCE, Ariel, 1998, *Los discursos sobre la muerte en la Castilla medieval (siglos VII-XV)*. Valladolid, Junta de Castilla y León.
- INFANTES, Víctor, 1997, *Las danzas de la muerte: génesis y desarrollo de un género medieval (siglos XIII-XVII)*. Salamanca, Universidad.
- JEREMIAS, Joachim, 1985, *Teología del Nuevo Testamento*. Vol. I. Salamanca, Sígueme.
- KINCH, Ashby, 2013, *Imago Mortis. Mediating Images of Death in Late Medieval Culture*. Leiden-Boston, Brill.
- LE GOFF, Jacques, 1981, *La naissance du Purgatoire*. Paris, Gallimard.
- LE GOFF, Jacques, 1985, *Lo maravilloso y lo cotidiano en el Occidente medieval*. Barcelona, Gedisa.
- Le Goff, Jacques, 2003, *En busca de la Edad Media*, Barcelona, Paidós.
- LÓPEZ GUIL, Itziar, ed., 2001, *Libro de Fernán Gonçález*. Madrid, Biblioteca Nueva.
- MARTÍN, Sabas, ed., 2001, *La Danza de la Muerte. Códice de El Escorial*, Madrid, Miraguano.
- MARTÍNEZ FALERO, Luis, 2011, «El tema de la muerte en la literatura popular europea: las danzas de la muerte y sus implicaciones doctrinales», *Revista Cálamo FASPE*, 58 (2011): 59-65.
- MARTÍNEZ GIL, Fernando, 1996, *La Muerte Vivida. Muerte y Sociedad en Castilla durante la Baja Edad Media*. Toledo, Diputación Provincial de Toledo.
- MINOIS, Georges, 1994, *Historia de los Infiernos*. Barcelona, Paidós.
- MIRA MIRALLES, Isabel, 2009, «'Muerte que a todos convidas': La muerte en la literatura hispánica medieval», *Revista de lenguas y literaturas catalana, gallega y vasca*, 14 (2008-2009): 291-326.

- MONEDERO, Carmen, ed., 1990, *Libro de Apolonio*. Madrid, Castalia.
- PÉREZ PRIEGO, Miguel Ángel, 2001, *Berceo y las postrimerías del hombre*. En Leonardo Funes y José Luis Moure, eds., *Studia in Honorem Germán Orduna*. Alcalá de Henares, Universidad de Alcalá: 523-533.
- RODRÍGUEZ BARRAL, Paulino, 2007, *La Justicia del más allá. Iconografía en la corona de Aragón en la baja Edad Media*. Valencia, Universitat de València.
- ROYER DE CARDINAL, Susana, 1992, *Morir en España. (Castilla Baja Edad Media)*. Buenos Aires, Universidad Católica Argentina.
- RUIZ GARCÍA, Elisa, 2011, «El *Ars moriendi*: una preparación para el tránsito». En *IX Jornadas Científicas sobre Documentación: La muerte y sus testimonios escritos*. Madrid, Universidad Complutense: 315-344.
- RUIZ, Juan (Arcipreste de Hita) [2008], *Libro de buen amor*. Ed. de Alberto Blecu. Madrid, Cátedra.
- SANMARTÍN BASTIDA, Rebeca, 2006, *El arte de morir. La puesta en escena de la muerte en un tratado del siglo XV*. Madrid, Iberoamericana.
- SAUGNIEUX, Joël, 1982a, «Berceo y el Apocalipsis». En Joël Saugnieux, *Berceo y las culturas del siglo XIII*. Logroño, Servicio de Cultura de la Excma. Diputación Provincial: 149-169.
- SAUGNIEUX, Joël, 1982b, «La economía de la salvación en los Milagros de Nuestra Señora», en Joël Saugnieux, *Berceo y las culturas del siglo XIII*. Logroño, Servicio de Cultura de la Excma. Diputación Provincial: 9-43.
- YÁÑEZ, Rodrigo, 1956, *El poema de Alfonso XI*. Anejo LXV de *Revista de filología española*, ed. Yo-Ten Cate. Madrid, Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas.
- ZUBILLAGA, Carina, 2004, «La configuración de la muerte en el Libro de buen amor como huella textual de un mundo en crisis», *Revista de poética medieval*, 13 (2004): 51-72.